

Opp/choice, in a one-on-one fight between the U.S.S. Enterprise and the Death Star, which spaceship wins?

ENTERPRISE

1. They're the good guys! And the Death Star are the bad guys! The good guys always beat the bad guys!

- Don't just take my word for it, look at the empirical evidence. The Enterprise is pretty much undefeated, while the Death Star is 0-2.

2. The Enterprise has lots of useful tricks up its sleeve (maybe subdivide into (2) gadgets and (3) strategies)

The crew will use their transporters to beam aboard the Death Star. Sure, that nameless guy with the red shirt will die, but the rest of the crew will successfully disable the shields and tractor beam and otherwise disarm the enemy spaceship. Can't you see Spock using the Vulcan Death Grip on the hapless Imperial guard who's guarding the Death Star's reactor core?

(the response to this argument is that the crew would inevitably have to face some obstacles, meaning that they'd get lost and be disposed of by the Garbage Monster)

If worst comes to worst, the crew can always beam aboard a lot of Tribbles and then just sit and wait. (The Tribbles will feast upon the innumerable trash compactors.)

Unlike the Death Star, the Enterprise can time travel, so every time it's about to lose, it can just slingshot around the sun, go back in time, and try again.

The Enterprise also could use a Romulan cloaking device to make it impossible to target, or to sneak very close to the exhaust port.

The Enterprise could navigate through an asteroid field – we know the Empire is dumb enough to fall for tricks like that, and the Death Star would be heavily damaged while the smaller, more maneuverable Enterprise would be fine.

DEATH STAR

1. Death Star is very strong

In general, the Enterprise would need a perfectly-executed plan to destroy the Death Star, while a mere one lucky shot from the Death Star would just blast the Enterprise into itty bitty bits.

Much, much more powerful weaponry... (a) has an accompanying fleet of TIE fighters (the only "huge support craft" the Enterprise has is Scotty's expanding waistline), (b) has

a tractor beam to immobilize the Enterprise, (c) has very tough shields, (d) just plain a lot bigger, so it has more guns, (e) it can blow up an entire planet, for crying out loud!

Lots, lots more people. Lots of stormtroopers. Sure, they can't hit anything to save their life, but neither can the red-shirted ensigns. Enterprise only has 430 crew members.

Also, since so many people are aboard, the wussy Enterprise crew will be paralyzed with moral indecision over the prospect of killing that many people. The Empire has no such scruples.

2. Death Star has no weaknesses the Enterprise can exploit

No weaknesses that the Enterprise can exploit. We're told in the Star Wars briefing scene that the *only way* to destroy the thing is via the exhaust port. But the Enterprise is far too large and hard to maneuver to exploit that small vulnerability – there's no way it'd fit into that trench – rendering the Death Star all but invincible.

And, even if the Enterprise somehow did manage to make it to the exhaust port, its photon torpedoes are simply too big to fit inside that narrow aperture. Yes, size matters.

Also, even so, we are told in the briefing that it has to be a *proton* torpedo that enters the exhaust port, while the Enterprise only has *photon* torpedoes. This is an important distinction. A *round-winning* distinction.

Without any women aboard, Kirk will not have any motivation. (So, the Death Star lacks the vulnerability of having women to motivate Kirk.)

3. Death Star has the Force

Plus, they have the Force. Darth Vader and/or the Emperor will not stand idly by... they'll use their Force powers to make the Enterprise's wimpy photon torpedoes ineffective... not that it'd matter if the torpedoes hit, anyway, since they'd only scratch the Death Star's paint.

uncreativityAIM: FYI I had gone without sleep for nearly two days at the time I wrote this up

uncreativityAIM: death star is pretty tight

melink14: so is it the finished second death star? And I'm guessing that all the resources of the ships are also in the equation.

melink14: Yeah, it's pretty tight for the death star. Fucking tie fighters, man. Also, it can only be destroyed from the inside

uncreativityAIM: accept the file transfer

melink14 received C:\Documents and Settings\Daniel Barclay\My Documents\MIT\Debate\Death Star vs Enterprise case.doc.

uncreativityAIM: it's the first death star

uncreativityAIM: tie fighters are pretty much a round-winning argument

melink14: lol

melink14: So, I guess, if the enterprise sent over data and worf and some others in a away mission to the engine core of the death star, that might work.

melink14: oh good, you made that point

uncreativityAIM: right

uncreativityAIM: an away team is pretty much the enterprise's only hope

melink14: technically, enterprise is millions of years ahead of the death star.

uncreativityAIM: lol, how does that matter

uncreativityAIM: all that means is that even if the enterprise does win, they'll be killing their own ancestors and thus bring about their own deaths bia time paradox

uncreativityAIM: so they best they can hope for is a tie

melink14: haha

melink14: we should say that on the other side.

melink14: hmm, so I'm guessing the photon torpedo is better than anything death star has.

melink14: Also, sense the death star doesn't have rotating freqencies for it's shields, the enterprise can match, fairly easily. letting it's phasers get in.

melink14: is this the first enterprise?

uncreativityAIM: kirk and crew

uncreativityAIM: you'd have to do the star trek spec, I don't know any

melink14: man, that makes it harder to win.

uncreativityAIM: pretty good at faking expertise in areas I know nothing about

melink14: haha, for sure you are.

melink14: I can do it if I have a little information. You can do it you have no information at all. Yay, Jews.

melink14: Also, even so, we are told in the briefing that it has to be a proton torpedo that enters the exhaust port, while the Enterprise only has photon torpedoes. This is an important distinction. A round-winning distinction.

melink14: lmao

uncreativityAIM: :-)